



City of Portland, Oregon
Bureau of Development Services
Land Use Services
FROM CONCEPT TO CONSTRUCTION

Dan Ryan, Commissioner
Rebecca Esau, Director
Phone: (503) 823-7300
Fax: (503) 823-5630
TTY: (503) 823-6868
www.portland.gov/bds

Date: November 9, 2021
To: Interested Person
From: Tim Heron, Land Use Services
503-823-7726 / Tim.Heron@portlandoregon.gov

NOTICE OF A TYPE I DECISION ON A PROPOSAL IN YOUR NEIGHBORHOOD

The Bureau of Development Services has a approved proposal in your neighborhood. The mailed copy of this document is only a summary of the decision. The reasons for the decision are included in the version located on the BDS website <http://www.portlandonline.com/bds/index.cfm?c=46429>. Click on the District Coalition then scroll to the relevant Neighborhood, and case number. If you disagree with the decision, you can appeal. Information on how to do so is included at the end of this decision.

CASE FILE NUMBER: LU 21-090868 HR – BELL TOWER COLUMN REPLACEMENT

GENERAL INFORMATION

Applicant: Thomas Bertrand, Professional Roof Consultants
thomas.bertrand@professionalroofconsultants.com
1108 SE Grand Ave Suite 300
Portland OR 97214

Owner/Agent: Msgr Gerard Oconnor, St Mary Catholic Cathedral Of Immaculate Conception Of Portland ORegon
1716 NW Davis St
Portland, OR 97209

Site Address: 1715 NW COUCH ST

Legal Description: BLOCK 167 LOT 1-8, COUCHS ADD
Tax Account No.: R180215070
State ID No.: 1N1E33DB 05400
Quarter Section: 3028

Neighborhood: Northwest District, contact Greg Theisen at 503-227-5430.
Business District: Nob Hill, contact at nobhillportland@gmail.com & Pearl District Business Association, contact at info@explorethepearl.com
District Coalition: Neighbors West/Northwest, contact Mark Sieber at 503-823-4212.

Plan District: Northwest
Other Designations: Contributing Resource in the Alphabet Historic District, listed in the National Register of Historic Places in November 16, 2000

Zoning: RM4d, Multi-dwelling Residential 4 with design overlay

Case Type: HR, Historic Resource Review
Procedure: Type I, an administrative decision with appeal to the Oregon Land Use Board of Appeals (LUBA).

Proposal:

The applicant requests Historic Resource Review approval to replace two columns on the south elevation of the belfry at the top of the St Mary Catholic Cathedral Church bell tower. The two columns have split and are structurally unstable. St. Mary's Cathedral Church proposes to temporarily shore up the top of the bell tower, remove the two compromised columns, and install two new steel columns to be encased in glass-fiber-reinforced concrete shells that will visually match the appearance of the existing rebar-reinforced precast/cast stone columns.

Because the proposal is for exterior alterations to an existing building in the Alphabet Historic District, Historic Resource Review is required.

Relevant Approval Criteria:

In order to be approved, this proposal must comply with the approval criteria specified in the Portland Zoning Code. The relevant approval criteria are:

- Community Design Guidelines
- Alphabet Historic District Community Design Guidelines Addendum

ANALYSIS

Site and Vicinity: The site is located on the full block bounded by NW 17th and 18th Avenues and NW Couch and Davis Streets within the Alphabet Historic District. St Mary's Cathedral was constructed in 1925 designed by Jacobberger and Smith, in the Twentieth Century Romanesque and Byzantine style, with a red tiled gable roof, cast-stone Corinthian columns, and a square tower with copper cornices. The marble floor in the apse was laid in 1926. The new marble on the floor in the remainder of the cathedral is a pattern of several Italian marbles. The doors are white oak in cast bronze on the exterior. Letters on the granite sign are Roman majuscules from the Trajan inscription in Rome. The coat of arms on the sign is of the Archdiocese of Portland in Oregon. The three bells of the tower were cast in the late 1880s and originally installed in the former cathedral at Third and Stark Streets. They were manually pealed until 2017, when the bells and yokes were refurbished and fitted with linear ringing motors. They sound at the pitches of D¹, F¹, and Ab¹.

The Alphabet Historic District, recognized by listing in the National Register of Historic Places in 2000, encompasses an entire neighborhood. It is significant for associations with both individuals and historic trends, and also for its architectural expressions. The district includes a broad mix of building types, ranging from single-family residences to quarter-block apartment buildings to one- and two-story commercial structures to substantial religious institutions. The period of significance is also quite broad, 1880 to 1940, meaning that a significant range of stylistic approaches, from Italianate to Art Deco, is represented. Overall district cohesiveness is supported by a regular pattern of tree-lined streets and a consistent mid-range scale of buildings punctuated by an occasional larger structure.

Zoning: RM4 zone. The RM4 zone is a high density, urban-scale multi-dwelling zone applied near the Central City, and in town centers, station areas, and along civic corridors that are served by frequent transit and are close to commercial services. It is intended to be an intensely urban zone with a high percentage of building coverage and a strong building orientation to the pedestrian environment of streets, with buildings located close to sidewalks with little or no front setback. This is a mid-rise to high-rise zone with buildings of up to seven or more stories. The Design overlay zone is applied to this zone.

The Historic Resource Overlay Zone protects certain historic resources in the region and preserves significant parts of the region's heritage. The regulations foster pride among the region's citizens in their city and its heritage. Historic preservation beautifies the city,

promotes the city's economic health, and helps to preserve and enhance the value of historic properties.

Land Use History: City records indicate that prior land use reviews include the following:

- LU 17-112471 CU – Withdrawn proposal for new 6-story multi-dwelling building on north lot.
- LU 17-112462 HR – Withdrawn proposal for new 6-story multi-dwelling building on north lot; and
- LU 02-151409 CU – Conditional Use approval for expansion of St. Mary's Cathedral and an increase to the number of parking spaces on north lot;
- LU 00-007364 CU AD – Conditional Use approval for cathedral expansion with Adjustments to landscaping and setbacks on east lot;
- LU 61-003662 CU (ref. file CU 107-61) – Conditional Use approval for a parochial school and secondary religious building;

Agency Review: A Notice of Proposal in your Neighborhood was mailed on **October 14, 2021**.

Neighborhood Review: A Notice of Proposal in Your Neighborhood was mailed on **October 14, 2021**. No responses have been received from either the Neighborhood Association or notified property owners in response to the proposal.

ZONING CODE APPROVAL CRITERIA

Chapter 33.846, Historic Reviews

Purpose of Historic Design Review

Historic Design Review ensures the conservation and enhancement of the special characteristics of historic resources.

Historic Design Review Approval Criteria

Requests for historic design review will be approved if the review body finds the applicant has shown that all of the approval criteria have been met.

Findings: The site is located within the Alphabet Historic District. Therefore, the proposal requires Historic Design Review approval. The applicable design guidelines are the Community Design Guidelines and the Historic Alphabet District Community Design Guidelines Addendum [33.846.060 E.1.c].

Historic Alphabet District - Community Design Guidelines Addendum

These guidelines were adopted on September 5, 2000 and were developed to work with the Community Design Guidelines to provide a set of guidelines specific to the district.

Community Design Guidelines

These guidelines provide the constitutional framework for all design review areas outside the Central City that are not covered by their own specific area design guidelines. The Community Design Guidelines focus on three general categories: **(P) Portland Personality**, which establishes Portland's urban design framework; **(E) Pedestrian Emphasis**, which states that Portland is a city for people as well as cars and other transportation systems; and **(D) Project Design**, which assures that each development is sensitive to both Portland's urban design framework and the users of the city.

Staff has considered all guidelines and only has addressed those considered applicable to this proposal. Historic Alphabet District Guidelines and Community Design Guidelines are addressed concurrently.

Historic Alphabet District Approval Criteria

2. Differentiate New from Old. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new

construction will retain historic materials that characterize a property to the extent practicable. Replacement materials should be reasonable facsimiles of the historic materials they replace. The design of new construction will be compatible with the historic qualities of the district as identified in the Historic Context Statement.

Findings: The proposed glass-fiber reinforced concrete [GFRC] columns will match the profile and dimensions, and nearly mimic the appearance, of the deteriorated concrete columns they are replacing, maintaining a coherent expression overall with the belfry tower. The newer GRFC columns will not be noticeable from the original concrete columns from the street, but upon close inspection from the immediate roof edge – where one would have to be compelled and safely strapped to roofing anchors – the differentiation of the GRFC material from the adjacent original columns will be perceivable. *This guideline is met.*

3. Hierarchy of Compatibility. Exterior alterations and additions will be designed to be compatible primarily with the original resource, secondarily with adjacent properties, and finally, if located within a historic or conservation district, with the rest of the District. Where practical, compatibility will be pursued on all three levels. New development will seek to incorporate design themes characteristic of similar buildings in the Historic Alphabet District.

Findings: The replacement of the two failing columns with two new GFRC columns designed to closely mimic the existing belfry columns will be a compatible addition to this contributing resource. Because only two columns are proposed for replacement, the overall integrity and coherency of the existing belfry columns ensemble will be maintained and ensure compatibility with this contributing building in the historic district. *This guideline is met.*

Community Design Guidelines

P1. Community Plan Area Character. Enhance the sense of place and identity of community plan areas by incorporating site and building design features that respond to the area's unique characteristics and neighborhood traditions;

P2. Historic and Conservation Districts. Enhance the identity of historic and conservation districts by incorporating site and building design features that reinforce the area's historic significance. Near historic and conservation districts, use such features to reinforce and complement the historic areas.

Findings for P1 and P2: The affected property is a contributing resource in the Alphabetic Historic District. The structure was constructed in 1925, designed by Jacobberger and Smith, in the Twentieth Century Romanesque and Byzantine style, with a red tiled gable roof, cast-stone Corinthian columns, and a square tower with copper cornices. Replacing the two failing concrete belfry columns with two new matching GFRC columns ensures that the belfry element of this contributing resource is preserved. The new columns are compatible with the existing character and design of this contributing building, as well as the historic district. *These guidelines are met.*

D6. Architectural Integrity. Respect the original character of buildings when making modifications that affect the exterior. Make additions compatible in scale, color, details, material proportion, and character with the existing building.

D8. Interest, Quality, and Composition. All parts of a building should be interesting to view, of long-lasting quality, and designed to form a cohesive composition.

Findings for D6 and D8: The replacement of the two failing concrete belfry columns with two matching GRFC columns will maintain the coherency of the belfry tower ensemble of this contributing building. GFRC is a long-lasting material, and a cohesive compliment to the long-standing concrete columns that still support the belfry roof today. No other changes are proposed. *These guidelines are met.*

DEVELOPMENT STANDARDS

Unless specifically required in the approval criteria listed above, this proposal does not have to meet the development standards in order to be approved during this review process. The plans submitted for a building or zoning permit must demonstrate that all requirements of Title 11 can be met, and that all development standards of Title 33 can be met or have received an Adjustment or Modification via a land use review, prior to the approval of a building or zoning permit.

CONCLUSIONS

The purpose of historic resource review ensures the conservation and enhancement of the special characteristics of historic resources. The proposed changes are modest, meet the approval criteria, and maintain the existing building's contributing features without detracting from the special characteristics of the Alphabet Historic District.

ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION

Approval to replace two original concrete columns on the south elevation of the belfry at the top of the St Mary Catholic Cathedral Church bell tower with two matching glass-fiber reinforced concrete columns.

Approval per Exhibits C-1 through C-5, signed and dated November 4, 2021, subject to the following conditions:

- A. As part of the building permit application submittal, the following development-related conditions (B through C) must be noted on each of the four required site plans or included as a sheet in the numbered set of plans. The sheet on which this information appears must be labeled "ZONING COMPLIANCE PAGE- Case File LU 21-090868 HR." All requirements must be graphically represented on the site plan, landscape, or other required plan and must be labeled "REQUIRED."
- B. At the time of building permit submittal, a signed Certificate of Compliance form (<https://www.portlandoregon.gov/bds/article/623658>) must be submitted to ensure the permit plans comply with the Design/Historic Resource Review decision and approved exhibits.
- C. No field changes allowed.

Staff Planner: Tim Heron



Decision rendered by: _____ **on November 4, 2021**

By authority of the Director of the Bureau of Development Services

Decision mailed November 9, 2021

Procedural Information. The application for this land use review was submitted on September 28, 2021, and was determined to be complete on **October 11, 2021**.

Zoning Code Section 33.700.080 states that Land Use Review applications are reviewed under the regulations in effect at the time the application was submitted, provided that the application is complete at the time of submittal, or complete within 180 days. Therefore this application was reviewed against the Zoning Code in effect on September 28, 2021.

ORS 227.178 states the City must issue a final decision on Land Use Review applications within 120-days of the application being deemed complete. The 120-day review period may be waived or extended at the request of the applicant. In this case, the applicant did not

waive or extend the 120-day review period. Unless further extended by the applicant, **the 120 days will expire on: February 8, 2022.**

Some of the information contained in this report was provided by the applicant.

As required by Section 33.800.060 of the Portland Zoning Code, the burden of proof is on the applicant to show that the approval criteria are met. The Bureau of Development Services has independently reviewed the information submitted by the applicant and has included this information only where the Bureau of Development Services has determined the information satisfactorily demonstrates compliance with the applicable approval criteria. This report is the decision of the Bureau of Development Services with input from other City and public agencies.

Conditions of Approval. If approved, this project may be subject to a number of specific conditions, listed above. Compliance with the applicable conditions of approval must be documented in all related permit applications. Plans and drawings submitted during the permitting process must illustrate how applicable conditions of approval are met. Any project elements that are specifically required by conditions of approval must be shown on the plans, and labeled as such.

These conditions of approval run with the land, unless modified by future land use reviews. As used in the conditions, the term "applicant" includes the applicant for this land use review, any person undertaking development pursuant to this land use review, the proprietor of the use or development approved by this land use review, and the current owner and future owners of the property subject to this land use review.

This decision, and any conditions associated with it, is final. It may be appealed to the Oregon Land Use Board of Appeals (LUBA), within 21 days of the date the decision is mailed, as specified in the Oregon Revised Statute (ORS) 197.830. Among other things, ORS 197.830 requires that a petitioner at LUBA must have submitted written testimony during the comment period for this land use review. Contact LUBA at 775 Summer St NE Suite 330, Salem, OR 97301-1283 or phone 1-503-373-1265 for further information.

The file and all evidence on this case are available for your review by appointment only. Please call the Request Line at our office, 1900 SW Fourth Avenue, Suite 5000, phone 503-823-7617, to schedule an appointment. I can provide some information over the phone. Copies of all information in the file can be obtained for a fee equal to the cost of services. Additional information about the City of Portland, city bureaus, and a digital copy of the Portland Zoning Code is available on the internet at www.portlandonline.com.

Recording the final decision.

If this Land Use Review is approved the final decision will be recorded with the Multnomah County Recorder.

- *Unless appealed*, the final decision will be recorded after **November 9, 2021** by the Bureau of Development Services.

The applicant, builder, or a representative does not need to record the final decision with the Multnomah County Recorder.

For further information on your recording documents please call the Bureau of Development Services Land Use Services Division at 503-823-0625.

Expiration of this approval. An approval expires three years from the date the final decision is rendered unless a building permit has been issued, or the approved activity has begun.

Where a site has received approval for multiple developments, and a building permit is not issued for all of the approved development within three years of the date of the final decision, a new land use review will be required before a permit will be issued for the remaining development, subject to the Zoning Code in effect at that time.

Applying for your permits. A building permit, occupancy permit, or development permit may be required before carrying out an approved project. At the time they apply for a permit, permittees must demonstrate compliance with:

- All conditions imposed herein;
- All applicable development standards, unless specifically exempted as part of this land use review;
- All requirements of the building code; and
- All provisions of the Municipal Code for the City of Portland, and all other applicable ordinances, provisions and regulations of the City.

EXHIBITS

NOT ATTACHED UNLESS INDICATED

- A. Applicant's Statement
 - 1. Original Submittal
- B. Zoning Map (attached)
- C. Plans/Drawings:
 - 1. Site Plan/ Elevation/ Photo (attached)
 - 2. Enlarged Elevation Shoring Plan
 - 3. Enlarged Column details 1
 - 4. Enlarged Column detail 2 (attached)
 - 5. Enlarged Column detail 3
- D. Notification information:
 - 1. Mailing list
 - 2. Mailed notice
- E. Agency Responses: No responses were received.
- F. Correspondence: No responses were received.
- G. Other:
 - 1. Original LU Application

The Bureau of Development Services is committed to providing equal access to information and hearings. Please notify us no less than five business days prior to the event if you need special accommodations. Call 503-823-7300 (TTY 503-823-6868).