

Parking Management Manual SAC

Monday, November 27, 2017

4 p.m. – 6 p.m.

Congress Center

1001 SW 5th Ave, Room 507

Portland, OR 97204

Meeting Notes

Members in Attendance

Lisa Frisch (Portland Business Alliance), Tony Jordan (Portlanders for Parking Reform), Juliana Lukasik (CEIC), Rick Michaelson (NW), Kathryn Doherty-Chapman (Go Lloyd), Bob Hillier (Freight Committee staff)

Project Team in Attendance

PBOT: Chris Armes, Mauricio Leclerc, Malisa McCreedy, Nicole Powell, Kelly Sills; Kimley-Horn: Joseph Spencer, William Reynolds; Rick Williams: Rick Williams

Additional Attendees

Peter Stark (CEIC)

Public Comment Period

- No public comment.

Workshop Outline

- Agenda change: Truck Loading Zones 4-5pm, Enforcement Revisions 5-6pm
- Updated Schedule
 - January 15 is MLK Jr Day, so the meeting will be moved to January 22 to review the draft manual, talk through chapters after having at least three weeks to review the draft manual.
 - Public open houses will be held in February to get additional feedback.
 - The final version of the manual that incorporates feedback and public comment will be presented at the March 19 meeting. If all goes as planned, we will take the PMM to Council in April.
- Meeting Logistics: Use name card to request floor, we need to hear from everyone.

Focus Area #1: Truck Loading Zones

1. Background

- We first went to the Freight Committee to get preliminary feedback on what is working well in terms of the on-street loading zones. There was good discussion and based on that feedback we crafted a draft version of the memo and took it back to the Freight Committee in October. What you have in front of you has been through one review process. We will discuss it today and review it one more time.
- What are the issues?

- No standard process for reviewing/approving TLZ requests
- 44 separate sign designations
 - Rick M – There aren't 44 kinds of signs, there are 44 sets of rules.
- No guidance on default placement of TLZs
- Lack of data on existing TLZs
- Committee's charge
 - Establish guidance for reduced number of standard Loading Zone sign options
 - Establish guidance for preferred location for TLZs
 - Inform TLZ review process
- Background – Truck Parking and Loading Plan (2016)
 - No Policy Change Required
 1. Develop a TLZ Review Process
 2. Enhance TLZ Enforcement
 3. Eliminate Free Truck Parking
 4. (Planning Division) Reevaluate Off-Street Loading Requirements
 - Policy Change Required
 5. Establish Commercial Loading Zones
 6. (Planning Division) Establish Truck Loading Streets
 7. (Planning Division) Establish Peripheral Distribution Centers
 8. (Planning Division) Establish Drop-box Areas
 9. (Planning Division) Develop a Cargo Bike Policy
 - As part of the PMM we are focusing on item 1) Develop a TLZ Review Process. We won't be getting into any of the off-street loading requirements, we are just going to focus on the performance of the on-street truck loading zones.
 - Juliana – You are not going to get into off-street at all for this manual?
 - Malisa – That is correct, it is a separate effort with Planning. Off-street is in Title 33 which is administered by Planning. We aren't governed by Title 33.
- Desired Outcomes
 1. Establish truck loading zones in areas that are as close to the receiving areas of shipping/receiving businesses as possible.
 2. Designate truck loading zones to balance the various user demands.

3. Consider greater use of “combination zones” to maximize the efficiency of truck loading zones to meet demand and capture capacity in periods of low or non-use for freight delivery.

4. Enforcement of parking and loading rules should be rigorous.

2. Draft Guidance

- Recommended Implementation Elements

1. Establish 3 to 5 Standard Loading Zone Sign options

2. Maximize use of combination zones for both TLZ and customer/visitor use

TLZ Designation	Combination Zone Option	Comments
7AM – 7PM MON - SAT	Yes	Open for any use 7PM – 7AM.
7AM – 11AM MON - SAT	Yes	Combination Zone option 11AM – 7PM. Unregulated SUN.
7AM – 2PM MON - FRI	Yes	Combination Zone option 2PM – 7PM. Unregulated SAT/SUN.
10PM – 7AM ALL DAYS	Yes	Combination Zone option 7AM – 7PM.
ALL HOURS ALL DAYS	No	Requires business to demonstrate need for 24-hour zone.

- Rick M – Asks how the combination zone options work.
 - These signs all exist today.
 - Rick W – There are examples of these near Pioneer Place and in NW.
 - William – It is two separate signs; the truck loading zone sign and the pay to park sign.
 - Malisa – The pay to park sign reads, pay to park all meter hours.
- 7AM – 11AM MON – SAT, is the morning options, in NW and areas with morning deliveries
 - Chris – This is a starting point when people come in and ask for a loading zone. Then we talk about what their needs are to determine if they need different signage.
 - Rick M – Not on Sunday even if an area has parking enforcement on Sunday?
 - Yes, that is correct.
- 7AM – 2PM MON – FRI, if a business needs noontime deliveries
 - Juliana – What is the logic for excluding Saturday?

- William – A tradeoff for the business, if they want to concentrate deliveries to the morning hours and include Saturday or if they want an extended period, they can concentrate that during weekdays.
 - Malisa – You can park in any metered spot until 10:30am for loading and unloading. A lot of places don't need Saturday due to business hours, especially downtown, the retail core does, but many offices don't.
 - 10PM – 7AM ALL DAYS, the overnight option, allows for a combination zone during daytime hours
 - ALL HOURS ALL DAYS, business to demonstrate need, they are receiving deliveries over 24 hours
 - Juliana – What is the process to demonstrate need? Is it difficult?
 - Malisa – Example in Central Eastside where they have 24 hour shifts, they have a full day workforce/business is open 24 hours, not difficult to demonstrate if this is how they operate.
 - Kelly – Would it be fair to say that the 7AM – 7PM zone offers a broader reach than the 7AM – 11AM zone? For example the 7AM – 11 AM may envision deliveries in a 1-2 block radius, where the 7 AM – 7PM may be serving more of a radius, say 3 blocks. Does it envision one zone serving more businesses?
 - Rick W – We hadn't thought of that, but it might come up in the conversations when the freight people sit down to discuss the process with the City. The memo tries to be as flexible as possible, those type of conversations would be helpful.
 - Lisa – I defer to the Freight Committee on a lot of this, but what about unscheduled deliveries, how are those accommodated in the afternoon? I don't see how those are accommodated in the afternoon unless it is an all hours all day zone.
 - Rick W – The 7 AM – 7 PM zone would accommodate afternoon deliveries.
 - Juliana – Want to clarify the combination zones. 7AM – 11 AM is only a truck loading zone, not a combination zone, during those hours?
 - Yes.
 - Juliana – If a company has unscheduled deliveries all day they can request a 7 AM – 7 PM zone?
 - Rick W – Yes. Their options would really be 1 (7 AM – 7 PM MON – SAT) and 5 (ALL HOURS ALL DAYS).
 - Malisa – As an example, the Nines gets small deliveries all day, so we worked with them to create two ALL HOURS ALL DAYS spaces and the rest of the block is 7 AM – 11 AM.
 - Juliana – Why wouldn't all businesses request 7 AM – 7 PM zones?
 - Malisa – It comes down to your customers being able to access your business. This is trying to build capacity in the on-street system. It is a tool for us to work with the businesses.

- Rick W – The City could go back to the business and talk about needs of business based on data collected. Creating a more simplistic sign and communication system based on data.
- Rick M – Why a 7am start time?
 - Malisa – That is the sign that already exists, the one we have used historically.
 - Chris – Enforcement can start at 7am.
 - Kelly – It helps clear the zones, so when the trucks come in they are already clear of cars.
- Kelly – We are kind of talking in the context of a business requesting a zone, but these aren't really attached to one business. Sometimes just one business might be taking advantage of it, but it is better to think of these as regional assets.
- Lisa – How far is okay to go from a truck loading zone to a business? What is the measurement?
 - Bob – It depends on what is being delivered, don't want to move large items as far or interfere with pedestrian safety, etc. Usually look for as close as possible.
 - Malisa – We would like to have regular data collection because there is no best practice.
 - Lisa – It would be nice to have information to provide to retailers.
 - Kelly – I pursued that question through the US Highway Administration, which has done a lot of studies on trucking and freight delivery, and to their knowledge no one has ever really studied/reported on that.
- Rick M – In NW TLZs seem useless, people ignore them, perhaps short-term parking spaces that people can use at their leisure would be better. We don't want them on 21st or 23rd Avenues because the trucks are too wide.
- Juliana – Why #4 (10 PM – 7 AM ALL DAYS)? There is no enforcement during those time frames.
 - Malisa – We have enforcement out past 10pm and they do come in at 7am. It is mostly to allow for overnight delivery, especially on main business/commercial corridors that wouldn't allow for that during the day because the demand for short-term parking is high.
 - Kelly – Police enforce parking too, but it is not their top priority.
- Juliana – There is a person in the Central Eastside that has a retail establishment with no loading zone and meters in front, in the past they have been able to reserve the meters to allow for deliveries, but that process doesn't work anymore because they need to provide more time to give notice. If somebody wants one of these and there is a meter in front of the business, will this process allow us some flexibility to help a retailer like that?

- Malisa – You can park at the meters until 10:30am for loading and unloading regardless.
- Chris – This wouldn't necessarily accommodate that either because anyone can use the TLZ if it is available.
- Malisa – They are working on reducing the wait time for the reservation process.
- Chris – Loading time is 30 minutes, if she needs it for more than 30 minutes, the TLZ would not accommodate her.
- Joe – In terms of data collection it is easier for retailers to demonstrate when they get deliveries due to online tracking.
 - Malisa – I don't know if we'd ask businesses to do that, we will do our data collection and rely on that because we don't know if a retailer's delivery is taking place in a certain spot based on the retailer information.
 - Rick M – It is important that the loading zone not be based on one business because then they feel like they own the space.
 - Rick W – Our hope is that data collection will take place on multiple days at various times of the day, we try to be comprehensive.
 - Rick M – Are you collecting this data as part of the NW data collection update?
 - Rick W – We will collect it after the first of the year in NW, CEID, and Downtown.
- Rick M – Would like to see the list of the other 39 TLZ signs.

3. Establish preferred location on block: at intersections, far side

- Malisa – So people know where to expect to find TLZ spots and short term parking.
- William – This also gets at the point of shared TLZ, share resources at the intersection not midblock right in front of your business.
- Lisa – Would unloading at the corner interfere with pedestrian traffic?
 - Malisa – No more than it already does.
 - Many express concerns about ramps in the pedestrian area.
 - Kelly – Most trucks use lift mechanism now.

4. Maintain current 30-minute time limits in truck loading zones (during TLZ designated hours)

- Rick M – 30-minute limit is helpful in NW to convert to short term spaces.

5. Limit TLZs on certain types of streets

TLZ Designation	Recommended Streets	Not Recommended
7AM – 7PM MON - SAT	Blue – Boulevard/Undesignated	Green - Flexible
7AM – 11AM MON - SAT	Blue – Boulevard/Undesignated	Green - Flexible
7AM – 2PM MON - FRI	Blue – Boulevard/Undesignated	Green - Flexible
10PM – 7AM ALL DAYS	Red – Retail/Commercial	Green - Flexible
ALL HOURS ALL DAYS	Red – Retail/Commercial Blue – Boulevard/Undesignated	Green - Flexible

- Malisa – Do you know if the rest of the Central City and comp plan have been adopted yet?
 - Mauricio – No, waiting for Council to approve, likely in May 2018. Delays due to legal reasons with the comp plan. For the Central City and outside we have a way of looking at the urban design and street designation, so this is an example in the Central City that the team is proposing to use.
 - Malisa – This map is also tying in how land use is going to be designated or is already designated. The red is retail/commercial corridors, planning and development would encourage uses for retail and commercial. Green streets are considered more residential, lots of tree scape, wider sidewalks, cycle tracks. Creating that relationship between transportation and land use.
 - William – On the more intensive retail corridors we are recommending identifying those largely as the overnight delivery options. Ideally avoiding TLZs on the green streets.

- Juliana – How did you come up with the green ones vs. the red ones?
 - Mauricio – This was a process years ago led by Planning to emphasize street type. Ex: Broadway is red, while Weidler is blue because Broadway is the main commercial corridor and Weidler supports it.

- Juliana – Are these related to freight movement? I see that MLK and Grand are red, while 7th is green. It appears you are placing the green loop on 7th. Where is all this coming from?
 - Mauricio – This map is coming from the Central City Plan and it is reflecting the retail function of MLK and part of Grand, some green features are the appropriate thing to say about 7th.
 - Malisa – We are using this map as an example of what is being adopted in the comp plan and we would like to tie where we designate truck loading zones to whatever gets adopted in the comp plan. We don't really have any influence on what the street colors/designations are.

- Juliana – Is there no more free truck parking? How does pricing work with loading zones?
 - Malisa – There is no pricing, we are not charging for truck loading.
- Rick M – The word boulevard to people means multilane multi capacity (like a boulevard in Paris), that is not what we are talking about here, they should find another name. The timing that we would like to see on commercial streets is the 7 AM – 11 AM and 7 AM – 2 PM, not the 10 PM – 7 AM or the ALL HOURS ALL DAYS.
 - Malisa – Part of the thought process is that because those are retail corridors during the day you want people to be able to park and access business, so have truck loading off to the side.
 - Rick M – It is really the ALL HOURS ALL DAYS one that gives me pause.
 - Malisa – We can remove the ALL HOURS ALL DAYS sign from the red retail corridors.
- Kathryn – I just want to clarify that this limits TLZs on certain streets based on the table, not that there won't be any.
 - Malisa – Correct, it is a starting point, a guideline.
 - Lisa – Considering the setting, like transit in downtown.
- Juliana – We talked about this whole PMM being for new districts, but we are really focused on changing things in current districts.
 - Malisa – We are trying to create a process moving forward and cleaning up existing signs. We did a review in Old Town China Town and collected data, next up is the Pearl, downtown, Lloyd, and everywhere else. We have 3.5 miles of TLZ in downtown, that is a lot of TLZ that could be used for other uses.

6. Initiate an Annual Review Process to Confirm On-Going Needs for TLZs

- Performance Metrics: Occupancy, Turnover, Duration of stay, Violation of rates, Peak hour of use
 - William – What you see in graphic is a trend of most recent data that demonstrates that utilization in TLZ decreases as the day goes on. Rick, can you discuss the data collection process?
 - Rick W – The goal is ongoing data collection, about every 1-2 years in some districts. The counts are taken every 20 minutes, the survey could miss trucks that park in the location less than 20 minutes. Each district will have a sample, that will hopefully move, so we aren't always collecting data at the same loading zones. It is budgeted to do 100 loading zones in every district twice a year for every 20 minutes. That will allow us to record the license plate number of the vehicle

so we can track it, it also gives the surveyor time to note the type of vehicle in the comment section. We will be able to track occupancy, turnover, duration of stay, violation rates, and peak hour of use. This will allow the City to have information at the block level.

- Malisa – Downtown will have sub districts.
- Rick W – In 2018 we will collect data in NW, Downtown, and the Central Eastside.
- Rick M – What questions are you trying to answer with the data collection?
 - Malisa – We are proposing an annual review.
 - Rick M – There need to be some expectations with outcomes.
 - Rick W – We are going to try to calibrate the use of stall to signage. Are we calibrated correctly? Are we over using or underusing?
 - Chris – There are lots of TLZs requested by businesses that are no longer there or their needs have changed.
 - Kelly – We never really did this before, so basically a loading zone was established at some year in the past and it might not be appropriate anymore. Now we are using data collection as the basis for those ongoing decisions.
- Rick W – Users can use the data to ask for what they need and the City can use the data to clean up the system.
 - Rick M – Would you also collect data on trucks that are double parked?
 - Rick W – Yes, it would be a variation of violation, that is what the comments section is for.
 - Kelly – That is critical information to record because that clues us into their inability to park at the curb and that they are creating a safety issue for the public.
- Lisa – When will you do the downtown survey?
 - Chris – March of 2018.
 - Rick W – We want to work with downtown to determine data collection zones before surveying.
 - Lisa – Right now would be the highest volume. March will be lower.
 - Rick W – First we must survey to determine baselines and can add new areas and seasons. We want to always keep a piece of the original data collection zones, but add new areas over time.

- Chris – Initially we want to look at what is sort of a standard.
- Malisa – We will take the updated document back to the Freight Committee in February to let them know what the updates are.
- Rick M – What implication does location of loading zones have for curb extensions?
 - Malisa – It would be the pull in and context sensitive.
 - Bob – This is why data is so valuable, needs can change, the size of truck delivering items can change, business needs can change. We can customize those needs if we have the data.
- Peter – In the Central Eastside we have quite a bit of industrial land, TPAC would prioritize parking for employees, loading and unloading. There may be a hybrid solution.

Enforcement

1. Document Updates Based on Discussion

- Recap – Updates based on what we heard last time, two big changes
 - Detailed data for warnings added, capture rate defined to include warnings
 - Added capture rate guidelines for select violation types to provide additional context
 - Meter violation: 30-40%, Loading Zone: 8-12%, Overtime Parking (Time Limit): 8-12%, Area Parking Permit Required: 3-12%
- Joe – We broke it out by category and tried to come up with numbers that were both reasonable within the specific violation type, but also looking at current issuance patterns the 15% overall capture rate that we think should be the performance goal. The APPP required 3-12%, the reason why that range is so great is because there is large variation in size of APPP districts, how busy they are, and how heavily they are patrolled. You won't get a high capture rate in a small zone like I with 1-2 officers on scooters at most during a day vs. Zone M with 6 enforcement beats, 4-6 officer patrolling on bicycle, you would expect a higher capture rate due to more enforcement.
- Rick M – Are we measuring the right thing? The issue in NW is not how many tickets are issued, it is how often parking enforcement is present and none of these metrics give us that information. It would be helpful to have some sort of transparent metric.
 - Joe – Enforcement is negotiating with a consultant for a more intensive assessment of what adequate staffing is, are the enforcement beats drawn properly, etc. That kind of metric is something that should come out of that study.
 - Chris – Joe spent a lot of time talking to Kezia about how enforcement has worked historically and what changes she wants to make to adjust moving forward. It will take time to get up to speed.

- William – One of the metrics we do include is the violation rate and the goal to have violations below 10% and that will come out of the data collection process.
- Chris – The goal is for people to pay the meter and follow the rules/signs on the street.
- Joe – You also want to look at your capture rate because if you are doing your studies properly you won't get gamed. If there are areas that are getting inadequate coverage they are going to have low capture rates, others that have better patrol are going to have better capture rates. You should be able to get an overall sense of how adequate your coverage is.
 - Chris – It is an understanding that they are consistently enforcing, particularly the meter areas with correct staffing.
 - Rick M – To know what the capture rate is you need to know the violation rate. How do you know the number of violations?
 - Joe – You do surveys to look at occupancy and turnover. You are looking for vehicles that are parked illegally.
 - Rick W – If parking is unregulated, no time limits, then there are no violations. When we collect data, we do inventory on stalls, we then write down the license plate numbers, so we are tracking how long the vehicles stay. Ex: if a single license plate stays into the third hour on a 2-hour stall, that is a violation. Violation rates are the number of unique license plates parking more than the posted time stay. The industry standard says for most commercial corridors the violation rate should be somewhere between 5-9% to have an efficient system. Ex: Salem uses violation rate to calibrate their deployment of enforcement staff. Their downtown was down to under 3%, they found through customer surveys that people thought enforcement officers were draconian. They reduced the amount of enforcement in the area and they are now up to 6% in our last survey. Bend has a violation rate of 8%, they kept their deployment as it was. The capture rate and violation rate if used together gives you an objective way to calibrate your deployment of staff.
 - Joe - The capture rate is the number of unique violations that are cited or warned (in this case).
 - Rick W – Ours is a little more granular because we are saying for every unique vehicle, you should never have more than 10% violating the time stay. The capture rate is a bigger number because it is just the number of tickets issued. Ours is a relationship to the total number of unique vehicles in the district. The enforcement officers don't know how many unique vehicles are in a district on any day, but our survey does know that, so that is why it is a finer number, the 5-9% that we are looking at.
 - Joe – We are recommending that they aim for a 15% capture rate, if you get any higher than that people won't want to come into Portland to shop. You want sufficient tickets issued, so they believe enforcement is real, but not too many, otherwise they won't want to come.

- Rick W – Another thing we learned in Spokane is the highest violation rates were on 1 hour meters. Before changing enforcement, we changed 1 hour to 2 hour meters.
 - Chris – We did that process here.
- Juliana – It seems like we are talking only about meters, we have a district that doesn't just have meters it has permits, how does this impact permit zones?
 - Rick W – We track permits. When we did the Central Eastside study we found that there were people with permits in stalls that did not allow permits, which is a violation.
 - Juliana – Is the Central Eastside getting less enforcement because we are a permit zone? Is there a way to make that fairer for districts that don't have a lot of meters?
 - Chris - Yes, meters typically get more enforcement and permit zones are more complaint driven.
 - Rick M – It depends on what our goals are. If the goal is to raise revenue then we want to patrol where the meters are because that has a direct relationship to income. If our goal is to make sure everybody obeys the rules it is probably important to patrol the other areas more often.
 - Rick W – Downtown is easier because it is all meters. In diverse districts like the Central Eastside and NW we do large samples. If we can go see a vehicle with a permit in a 2-hour stall that is not a violation regardless of how long they park there. If you have an unmetered stall you have violations when vehicles without permits stay past the time limit. Violations for people with permits happen when people with permits are parking where they are not supposed to park. We've talked about this on the Central Eastside, do we need to flex the number of permit stalls or are we taking stalls away from visitors? We found that in some of the places where the permits were parking in violation, the stalls were still 100% occupied with vehicles without permits.
 - Joe – Portland is relatively unique in that the studies that are done capture the entire plate. Generally, you take the last three characters of the plate. You can look at plates that are in violation when you are doing an occupancy study and you can turn it into a capture study because you also have the file of citations and warnings that are issued and compare those two files. You can generate violation and capture rates from those surveys.
 - Juliana – I want to clarify that it is still revenue generating if you are writing a ticket for somebody that has a violation in a permit zone. I'm told our goal is not to raise revenue, so if our goal is for diverse districts to have equal opportunity of enforcement as the non-diverse districts, even though it is a

little harder, I want to make sure these new districts that don't have meters right away have enforcement.

- Rick W – The data we are collecting will allow the City enforcement staff to calibrate their deployment because they have capture rate and violation rate goals. So even though it doesn't have a meter, if it is a time zone at a 20% violation rate and the average stay is less than 2 hours, maybe we need more enforcement here.
- Peter – It is trying to breakdown the barrier between metered areas and APPP areas. You say it could be 20%, it could be as high as 30%. We don't know because we don't have that level of study yet. We need more enforcement in the whole district. Two enforcement officers vs. twelve in downtown and we are larger.
- Lisa – Downtown feels the Central Eastside and NW should have more enforcement.
- Joe – I would be surprised if the recommendation is that they didn't need more enforcement officers.
- Julian – I support the data driven efforts and that we pay attention to areas that are diverse.
- Rick W – We will make sure we have diversity of stalls in our data collection zones.
- Peter – The capture rates don't mean anything unless you have the enforcement out there to make sense of it.
- Kelly – We have about 60,000 parking signs in Portland, we need enforcement to hold it together.
- William – The two major changes we made are updating the capture rate definition and adding capture rate guidelines. These are the two we changed and had a long discussion about because they are the two we felt we could incorporate into the PMMM.

Wrap-Up

- SAC #7 Overview
 - The next meeting will take place on January 22. We will provide you with the manual at least 3 weeks ahead of time to review. There will not be any new material, except for some updates to the TLZ documents.

Meeting adjourned.